

| | Current Oversight of Law Enforcement | Full Review Board | Full Investigatory Board | Hybrid Review/Investigatory Board | City of Alexandria Proposed Hybrid |
|--|--|--|--|--|--|
| Description | <p>APD conducts all investigations & reports results of investigations to the Office of Human Rights & Alexandria Human Rights Commission (AHRC) for their review. An agreement with State Police allows for their involvement in the most serious incidents.</p> <p>AHRC provides oversight on excessive force, demeaning language, & harassment cases.</p> | <p>APD would conduct all of the investigations, Board would review the investigations and make findings as to accuracy, completeness, and impartiality of investigations and issues recommendations as to discipline.</p> | <p>Board conducts all investigations</p> <p>APD no longer conducts any investigations (or no longer conducts certain kinds of investigations)</p> <p>Board becomes a separate city agency which obtains all necessary information for investigation and issues decisions on discipline</p> | <p>APD conducts all investigations except those assigned by the Code to the Board, with a focus on use of force by a law enforcement officer, death or serious injury to any person held in custody, serious abuse of authority or misconduct, allegedly discriminatory stops, and other incidents categorized as “abuse of authority” or “severe misconduct.”</p> | <p>Board, staffed by the police auditor and investigators, conducts all investigations involving use of force, severe misconduct, and incidents involving death as defined in the code. APD does all other investigations and Board may review any APD investigation. Board makes recommendations on policy matters.</p> |
| Subpoena Power | AHRC has subpoena power | Rarely | Frequently | Potentially on the matters it investigates | Yes, for matters it investigates |
| Binding Disciplinary Authority | No | No | Frequently | Potentially on matters it investigates | No. On matters it investigates it makes recommendations for discipline to the Chief and if not taken, the Chief must provide a written justification. |
| Receive Community Complaints | No | Frequently | Frequently | Potentially | Yes |
| Decide How a Complaint will be Handled | No | Rarely | Frequently | Yes | Yes |
| Review Police Complaint Investigations | Yes | Frequently | Rarely | Potentially | Yes |
| Conduct Independent, Investigations | No | Rarely | Frequently | Frequently | Yes, on matters as defined by the Code |
| Perform Data-Driven Policy Evaluations | No | Sometimes | Sometimes | Potentially | Yes |
| Recommend Findings on Investigations | Yes | Sometimes | Frequently | Frequently | Yes |
| Where Model is Used | | <p>The majority of civilian oversight bodies in the US are review boards, including:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Fairfax County Knoxville, TN St. Paul, MN Albany, NY | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Washington, DC San Francisco, CA Nashville, TN Pittsburgh, PA New York, NY San Diego County, CA | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Portland, OR Albuquerque, NM Kansas City, MO Atlanta, GA Berkeley, CA Cambridge, MA | |
| Pros | <p>No additional public bodies are needed;</p> <p>Provides a third party review without a new entity needing to be formed;</p> <p>Already has subpoena power;</p> <p>City Council appointed board.</p> | <p>Review Board & Management work as a team;</p> <p>Efficient process since investigations are all done the same way;</p> <p>Ensures the community has the ability to provide input into the complaint investigation process, increasing public trust.</p> <p>Generally, the least expensive form of oversight as it relies on volunteers.</p> | <p>Fully independent of law enforcement agency;</p> <p>Full-time civilian investigators may have highly specialized training;</p> <p>May reduce bias in investigations into resident complaints;</p> <p>Civilian-led investigations may increase community trust in the process.</p> | <p>Generally less expensive than full investigative bodies, but more expensive than review-focused bodies;</p> <p>Still uses existing processes/systems;</p> <p>Utilizes aspects of the investigative, review and auditing models in a combination that may be unique to the community</p> <p>Some researchers call a hybrid model the “Ideal Police Review System.”</p> | |
| Cons | <p>AHRC has other responsibilities and may not have expertise on policing matters;</p> <p>AHRC does not have independent authority to investigate police misconduct, not all investigations are independent of APD.</p> | <p>Review board volunteers may have limited authority, and few organizational resources, less expertise in police issues.</p> <p>May rely entirely on law enforcement for information and may be less independent than other forms of oversight.</p> | <p>Most expensive.</p> <p>Subpoena authority used to compel complainants or to testify, provide documents, or other evidence could raise concerns from community;</p> <p>Removes disciplinary responsibility &, therefore, control of employees from Chief of Police.</p> <p>Civilian investigators may face strong resistance from police personnel, create adversarial relationship;</p> | <p>Expensive and organizationally complex form of civilian oversight</p> <p>Will require additional staff.</p> | |
| Cost to City of Alexandria | No additional cost | <p>Approximate total cost: \$325,000 per year</p> <p>Includes:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Executive Director/Auditor Additional Assistant City Attorney Annual budget for other expenses | <p>Approximate total cost: \$825,000 per year</p> <p>Includes:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Executive Director/Auditor 2 investigators Board appointed attorney Additional Assistant City Attorney | <p>Approximate total cost: \$600,000 per year.</p> <p>Would likely include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Executive Director/Auditor At least one investigator Potential cost of outside counsel needs An additional Assistant City Attorney Annual budget for other expenses | <p>Approximate total cost: \$600,000 per year.</p> <p>Includes:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Executive Director/Auditor One investigator Part time outside legal counsel Assistant City Attorney Annual budget for other expenses |